



TITLE:

Discovering the 'Language' and the
'Literature' of West Java : An Introduction to
the Formation of Sundanese Writing in 19th
Century West Java(<Special Issue>The
Formation of the Indonesian Nation : In
Memory of the Late Professor Kenji
Tsuchiya)

AUTHOR(S):

Moriyama, Mikihiro

CITATION:

Moriyama, Mikihiro. Discovering the 'Language' and the 'Literature' of West Java : An Introduction to the Formation of Sundanese Writing in 19th Century West Java(<Special Issue>The Formation of the Indonesian Nation : In Memory of the Late Prof ...

ISSUE DATE:

1996-06

URL:

<http://hdl.handle.net/2433/56588>

RIGHT:

Discovering the 'Language' and the 'Literature' of West Java :

An Introduction to the Formation of Sundanese Writing in 19th Century West Java*

Mikihiro MORIYAMA**

I The 'Language'

Discovering the 'Language'

An ethnicity (*een volk*) is defined by a language.¹⁾ This idea had come to be generally accepted in the Dutch East Indies at the beginning of the twentieth century. The prominent Sundanese scholar, Raden Memed Sastrahadiprawira, expressed it, probably in the 1920s, as follows :

Basa teh anoe djadi loeloegoe, pangtetelana djeung pangdjembarna tina sagala tanda-tanda noe ngabedakeun bangsa pada bangsa. Lamoen sipatna roepa-roepa basa tea leungit, bedana bakat-bakatna kabangsaan oge moesna. Lamoen ras kabangsaanana soewoeng, basana eta bangsa tea oge lila-lila leungit. [Sastrahadiprawira in Deenik n. y. : 2]

[The language forms a norm : the most evident and the most comprehensive symbols (notions) to distinguish one ethnic group from another. If the characteristics of a language disappear, the distinguishing features of an ethnicity will fade away as well. If an ethnicity no longer exists, the language of the ethnic group will also disappear in due course of time.]

There is a third element involved : culture. Here too, Dutch assumptions exerted a great influence upon the thinking of the growing group of Sundanese intellectuals : a

* It occurred to me that I wanted to be a scholar when I first met the late Prof. Kenji Tsuchiya in 1980. It is he who stimulated me to write about the formation of Sundanology in a letter from Jakarta in 1985. This article will be a part of the results of that study. I would like to dedicate this article to my *guru*.

** 森山幹弘, 3-13-1-102, Shimoishihara, Chofu, Tokyo 182, Japan, moriyama @ific. or. jp

1) Prof. H. M. J. Maier has supervised me in the writing of *The Formation of Sundanese Writing in 19th-century West Java* as my dissertation. This article is an introduction to my dissertation. Much gratitude is due to him for his comments, for his help and for his constant encouragement. I am indebted to Alan Feinstein for reading the draft and making a number of helpful comments.

language is a representation of culture and a culture defines as well as supports an ethnicity. It is an idea that goes back to Romantic notions about the predominance of language.²⁾

An ethnic group is identified by a distinct language, and this language is the carrier of a culture. Lively and heated debates and discussions about the relationships between the three did not really take place. However, the idea of a close connection between language, culture, and ethnicity became increasingly predominant towards the end of the nineteenth century.

People in what we now call Sunda-speaking areas of Java were made aware of the fact that they had a distinct Sundanese culture, a distinct identity ; this awareness could only be strengthened by the administrative boundaries that the colonial government imposed on the island of Java. No doubt before Europeans came to their lands, the Sundanese people had already been aware that they were somehow different from the Javanese. Witness, for instance, the tale about Citrarasmi Diapitaloka, princess of Pajajaran, the glorious old Sundanese kingdom (European sources would say that the western part of Java was more or less united under the kingdom of Pajajaran between 1333–1579). On the instigation of his prime minister Gajah Mada, the powerful ruler of Majapahit, Hayam Wuruk, asked the princess to marry him, and the court of Pajajaran accepted the invitation. When the princess arrived in Bubad in East Java, she discovered that she had not come as a future queen but as a tribute, and she chose to kill herself rather than suffer humiliation (It is thought that this took place in 1357). Sundanese have always been familiar with this tale, and they remember the incident with anger and rage.³⁾ They know their land had once been a great and glorious kingdom and they themselves are the descendants of the people of the kingdom of Pajajaran. The tale suggests anti-Javanese sentiment and, more importantly, an awareness of being different from the Javanese.

However, this awareness of being ‘different’, or distinct had never been strong before the Dutch came to be more directly involved with local affairs. The other peoples of Central and East Java and other regions were not foreign enough to force the Sundanese to strictly objectivize themselves in terms of language, culture and ethnicity. The need was not strongly felt, if only because awareness of having a distinct and different language was not yet developed. They used languages depending on the situation, and in linguistic terms it could be said that they were sometimes Sundanese, sometimes Javanese, sometimes Malay. Land and place, rather than language, were the main issue,

2) The Dutch were much influenced by German thought in terms of language studies in the nineteenth century. For instance, von Humbolt and Herder had a great influence upon them.

3) Modern-day Sundanese are familiar with this tale, too. Sundanese parents are apt to not want to marry their daughter to a Javanese man.

and the language map of the island of Java was a continuum.

The arrival of the Dutch made the people of West Java more aware than they had ever been before that neither Javanese nor Malay were really their language, and that these languages carried cultures, identities, values and ideas that were not authentic to West Java. Colonial administrators and scholars forced them to objectivize themselves in opposition to the 'Javanese' and the 'Malay'.

This process of restriction and differentiation is aptly summarized in the words of Michael Bakhtin : "it is possible to objectivize one's own particular language, its internal form, the peculiarities of its world view, its specific linguistic habitus, only in the light of another language belonging to someone else, which is almost as much 'one's own' as one's 'native language'. . . . Where languages and cultures interanimate each other, language becomes something entirely different, its very nature changes" [Bakhtin 1981 : 62-65]. For Bakhtin, there is a decisive moment in the life of a speech community when it encounters a powerful language other than its own. Suddenly, everything changes under the pressure of this new-found "polyglossia" : "the simultaneous presence of two or more (national) languages interacting within a single cultural system." Sundanese awoke from its vague self-identification. The Dutch created a state of 'polyglossia' which stimulated the Sundanese intellectuals to think about their 'own' language, and thus about their 'own' culture, their 'own' ethnicity.

In fact, Sundanese had existed as a distinct language in West Java long before Europeans distinguished it from Javanese and regarded it as a mountain dialect of Javanese. It is evident from inscriptions and manuscripts that Sundanese had existed in the region for a long time [Ekadjati 1988]. A great number of *lontar* (palm-leaves) manuscripts written in so-called Old Sundanese exist as concrete evidence. Old Sundanese had been used before Javanese Mataram influence spread over the region and also was still used when Islam made its presence felt around the seventeenth century. It was written in a script which was different from both Javanese and Arabic script. However, it still belongs to Pallawa script from India. The language is not the same as the nineteenth century version which many Europeans found and described. Old Sundanese was mixed with Old Javanese, Kawi language, which is different from modern Javanese. Good examples are *Bujangga Manik* and *Carita Parahiyangan*, which were investigated by J. Noorduyn [1962]. In fact, the Sundanese language that received large influence from Mataram Javanese can be called 'new Sundanese'.

Sundanese, by the name of "Zondase taal," is mentioned as a language used in the western part of Java by a Dutch scholar from Leiden, Herbert de Jager (1636-1694), in the seventeenth century [Haan 1911 : Vol. 2, 134]. The term 'Javanese' had already been known by Europeans. It seems that from the seventeenth until the beginning of the nineteenth century Europeans saw the language that was used in the hinterland of Batavia and beyond in the mountains as a Javanese dialect. The Dutch called it "bergjavaans" (mountain Javanese), thus making it a variant of Javanese [Berge 1993 : 13-

17; Haan 1911: Vol. 2, 256]. The peasants who lived in the mountains presumably used simple Sundanese which was different from the language of those who made up the ruling and administering class. The Sundanese used by the local aristocrats, mostly living in and around the *kabupaten* (literally the seats of the indigenous chief *bupati* which functions as the centre of local government) was more refined. In turn, they thought that Javanese was 'higher' and more 'refined' than their own language [Haan 1912: Vol. 4, 513]. When visiting the courts of central Java to pay their respects, they were influenced and fascinated by Javanese courtesy, especially in terms of the language, in which various levels of speech had been developed. Since the latter half of the eighteenth century, centred at four royal houses in Jogjakarta and Surakarta, a sort of 'cultural involution' took place.⁴⁾ Many aspects of culture such as language, literature, batik, music and dance became more refined and elaborated. The Sundanese aristocrats tried to introduce this into Sundanese, too. As a result, their speech became heavily interspersed with Javanese elements.

These were the people European travellers, merchants and administrators had to deal with; little wonder that they thought they heard some kind of Javanese, an assumption that was only strengthened by the fact that most Sundanese who had direct contact with Europeans preferred to use forms of Javanese or Malay.

Adding to the confusion, the local aristocrats used a kind of Javanese among themselves at least until the middle of the nineteenth century, because it was considered more prestigious than Sundanese [Berge 1993: 17]. In particular they wrote official letters in Javanese rather than in Sundanese, while in their daily life they spoke Sundanese to each other. As for writing, Crawfurd observed: "The few who have any education aim at a little instruction in Arabic and Javanese, and even business is generally conducted in the latter" [Crawfurd 1820: Vol. 2, 68]. Arabic script, not language, which Crawfurd mentions, was used to write Sundanese, mostly for use on non-administrative occasions. Meanwhile, Javanese had for a long time been the official language and script in Sunda areas. Sundanese was regarded as informal and vernacular, to such an extent that it could be regarded as a humiliation if an aristocrat received a letter in Sundanese [Berge 1993: 16–17]. Taco Roorda (1801–1874), a professor of Oriental Languages and Literatures and Theoretical Philosophy at Amsterdam, gives a remarkable comment in the preface of De Wilde's dictionary about the relation between Sundanese and Javanese at that time.⁵⁾

4) Tsuchiya discussed, in particular, the literary florescence and called it "the Literary Renaissance" [1990: 93–96].

5) Taco Roorda was the most prestigious scholar of the languages of the East Indies in the middle of the nineteenth century. However, it is interesting that he had never been in the Dutch East Indies.

The regents in the Sunda region prefer to make use of Javanese in their correspondence with each other : even the address, in which letter written in Sundanese to a regent should be in Javanese. We see from this that Sundanese is considered as vernacular by the high class people and is by no means put on the same level as Javanese. [Roorda in De Wilde 1841 : x-xi]

This is a fact which led K. F. Holle, a tea planter in Priangan Regency and later honorary adviser on native affairs to the Government and the most influential person in the Sunda region, to assume that Javanese had been the official language in the Sundanese area since the time it was under the rule of the Javanese Mataram dynasty [Holle 1890 : 128-130]. However, their Javanese was not as refined as the Javanese used at the courts of Java : Sundanese themselves called it "Jaware," an acronym of "Jawa saware" (half Javanese).

Besides Javanese, Malay too had its own significant position in Sundanese society. It had been a language of communication (*lingua franca*) for a long time like in so many other parts of the archipelago. It was used between Dutch officials and Sundanese aristocrats for administrative affairs and in daily conversations. Malay had an independent position in the society.

The language map was a confusing one : Javanese, Malay and a particular form of Sundanese were used in the centres of administration and trade in the upland plains, while "bergjavaans" was spoken in the highland areas.

A first tentative effort to resolve the confusion was made by a simple comparative translation of the four languages published in 1780, i. e. *Nederduitfche Taal ; Sundase of Berg-taal ; Gemeene Javaanfe taal ; Javaanfe Hoog Dalamfetaal* (Low-German Language ; Sundanese or Mountain-language ; General Javanese language ; Javanese High Aristocratic-language) [Anonymous 1780 : 289]. Noteworthy here is that Sundanese was conceived of as a "taal" (language) among other "talen" (languages)— but it was to take another 60 years before Sundanese was fully recognized as a distinct language, and the Sundanese a people (*volk*) in their own right.

The British interregnum of Java from 1811 to 1816 gave strong impetus to the study of local history and culture. Thomas Stanford Raffles, the British Lieutenant Governor of Java, published *The History of Java* in 1817 and John Crawfurd, who was the Resident of Yogyakarta (1811-1816), published *History of the Indian Archipelago* in 1820. Both books were to have great impact on subsequent Dutch scholarship. Both Raffles and Crawfurd recognized Sundanese as a distinct entity, but their terminology differed. Raffles wrote,

The native population of Java, *Madura*, and *Bali*, islands most intimately connected with each other in every respect, use exactly the same written character, and it appears that one generic language prevails throughout these islands. Of this generic language, however, there are four dialects, differing so materially from each other as to be generally considered separate languages. It is, however, rather by admixture of other languages than by mere difference of

dialect that they are distinguished. These dialects or languages are the *Sunda*, spoken by the inhabitants of the mountainous districts of Java west of *Tegal*; the *Jawa* or Javan, which is the general language of Java east of Cheribon, and throughout the districts lying on the northern coast of the island; the *Madura* and the *Bali*, being the dialects or languages belonging to those islands respectively. [Raffles 1817: 357]

Is “the *Sunda*” a language or a dialect? In *A Comparative Vocabulary of the Malayu, Javan, Madurese, Bali, and Lampung Languages*, which was added to his monumental book as an appendix, Raffles shows his uncertainty of how to distinguish between the two. In the wordlists, Sundanese is not given an independent place, but instead is included in the column “Javan.” Apparently Sundanese was considered a variant of Javanese in the eyes of the Lieutenant Governor of Java.

Crawfurd had a more distinctive idea of Sundanese: he classed it among “Minor languages of the Archipelago” which, in his words, are the “many written languages of tribes less powerful and cultivated than the great nations of Java.” By the great nations and languages, he meant the Javanese, the Malay, the Bugis and Macassarese. Crawfurd was primarily interested in languages that had a written tradition; only those which had manuscripts were really worth studying. The obsession on writing in the European academic tradition was paramount.

That the British saw Sundanese as a distinct entity is also clear from their efforts to estimate the number of those who spoke it. Raffles guessed that the number who spoke Sundanese “does not exceed one-tenth of the population of the whole island; the remaining nine-tenths speak Javan” [Raffles 1817: 358]. Recent research on population in Indonesia suggests that this figure was under-estimated [Boomgaard 1991: 105]. According to their calculation, the population of the Sundanese-speaking regencies (Banten, Buitenzorg, Krawang, Priangan, half of Cirebon) was 681,782 in 1815.⁶⁾ Dutch colonial officials claimed to be able to make precise counts (!) of indigenous population. The population of the island of Java was 4,322,031. Thus about one-sixth of the population of the whole island seems to have spoken Sundanese. This proportion of Sundanese to Javanese speakers had not changed much by 1930 (one-fifth), when a census of ethnic groups was made. Raffles underestimated the number of Sundanese speakers because of the confusion of the language map. It is possible that he counted only the speakers of “bergjavaans,” which was spoken in the highland areas, and did not count the speakers of the refined Sundanese or *Jaware* which was spoken in the upland plains.

Raffles’ estimate is repeated by Crawfurd in his account. He says,

6) To simplify matters, I count half the population in Cirebon, but I do not omit some from Banten and Krawang, where Javanese was spoken. Although the number of the population of Javanese speakers in both regencies is excluded, the proportion one-sixth can be seen as one-seventh of the population of the whole island at most.

The *Sunda* is the language of the mountaineers of the western part of Java, of perhaps one-third of the area of the island, but, in round numbers, probably of not more than of one-tenth of its inhabitants. [Crawfurd 1820 : Vol. 2, 66]

Although their terminology may have been confused and confusing, both British scholar-administrators, somehow, appreciated the Sundanese language as a distinct entity and that in itself represents a break in European scholarship about Java.

This break was further confirmed by the studies of Andries de Wilde, a Dutch coffee planter in Sukabumi, who published an ethnographic study of the Preanger Regencies in 1829. He considered "de Soendasche" (Sundanese) as an independent language, as the following paragraph makes clear :

De taal, welke in deze Regentschappen gesproken wordt, is de soendasche ; dezelve verschilt van het Javaansch en Maleijsch, echter zijn er van beide laatste talen vele woorden bijingeslopen of aangenomen. Het schrift der priesters is Arabisch ; de meeste Hoofden kennen het ook ; anders wordt het Javaansch karakter, over het algemeen, gebruikt. [Wilde 1829 : 108]

[The language that is spoken in these Regencies is Sundanese ; this differs from Javanese and Malay. However there are many words which have crept in or been adopted from the latter languages. The script of the priests is Arabic ; most of the local chiefs know it too ; others generally use the Javanese script.]

De Wilde tried to draw attention to its difference from Javanese and Malay to show how distinct Sundanese was. In the revised edition of 1830,⁷⁾ he collected many Sundanese words about agriculture, customs, and Islam. The vocabulary indicates that he studied Sundanese language from his own experience.⁸⁾ However, he seems hesitant about using the term "Soendasche" for the words which he collected. Above all the book gives us the impression of his ambivalence towards the people who speak Sundanese. The word "Soendasche" is used only three times in the whole 230 pages of the book. These instances are the above mentioned "de Soendasch" (Sundanese language) and "de algemeene Soendasche naam" (the general Sundanese name) and "Soendasche volkeren" (Sundanese peoples). The first usage refers to the language, and the last two are adjectival. However, his usage of the plural form "volkeren" is strange and interesting. He suggested that many kinds of cultural entities lived in the Priangan regencies, that as

7) He revised the first edition because its contents were incomplete. He added a lot of information about Preanger Regencies in the revised edition [Wilde 1830].

8) He was a coffee planter in Sukabumi and his formal education left him unprepared for book-writing. He had a unique career : he was a sailor who was once arrested by the British authorities during the Napoleonic Wars [Haan 1910 : Vol. 1, 284 – 309].

a whole amounted to an ethnicity of Sundanese. De Wilde, however, he did not (want to) use words like “Soendaas” or “Soendanezen,” which became common some ten years later, to indicate the people directly. On the other hand, he uses the words “Javaan/Javanen” (Javanese people/peoples) 35 times and the adjectival form “Javaansche” 8 times. Moreover, “Berg-Javaan/Berg-Javanen” (Mountain Javanese people/peoples) are used 4 times. Both “Javaan” and “Berg-Javaan” indicate the people who were living in the Preanger Regencies. No distinction in usage between the two words is recognised. In short, according to De Wilde it was the Javanese and Mountain Javanese, not the Sundanese, who speak the Sundanese language and live in Preanger Regencies. The book also reveals uncertainty about the people as well in that he calls them variously “Soendasche volkeren,” “Javanen” and “Berg-Javanen.” It is possible that the situation in the 1830s influenced him to write in this way. The situation seems to imply that, prior to the publication of his book, no authority or academic circle had agreed on the existence of the Sundanese people *per se* or that Sundanese was a distinct language clearly differing from Javanese and not merely a dialect of Javanese. It seems that the years around 1830 represent the transition period in the recognition of the Sundanese language and the Sundanese as a people with their own distinct culture. This change was of great importance to the Sundanese as well. They had been feeling inferior to the Javanese since their Pajajaran kingdom was ruined and still more since Mataram governed them. Now they became clearly aware of their difference from the Javanese, regardless of high or low culture. The Sundanese and Javanese were simply juxtaposed by the Dutch in their administrative boundaries and by scholars in academic circles. It was the transition from inferiority to differentiation.

In 1841 the Sundanese language was acknowledged by the publication of the first Sundanese dictionary. The dictionary, *Nederduitsch-Maleisch en Soendasch Woordenboek*, was published by Roorda, at the time considered the most authoritative scholar of Oriental languages, in Amsterdam. The words in the dictionary had been collected by the above-mentioned De Wilde. The existence of Sundanese was now sanctioned by an authority in academia far away from the language of the society. In the preface Roorda makes a significant remark about Sundanese :

This is useful in the first place, especially, in order to become more closely acquainted with a language which was little known till now and of which the knowledge was imperfect ; the language is spoken in the west part of the Java island, which is called *Soenda* or *Soendalanden* by the natives, differing from the eastern part of the island ; the language differs considerably both from that properly called Javanese and from Malay, the language of the foreigners in the Dutch East Indies Archipelago. [Roorda in De Wilde 1841 : v]

Around the turn of the nineteenth century, Johann Gottfried Herder's (1744–1803) *Abhandlung über den Ursprung der Sprache* (On the Origin of Language), published in 1772,

had become of great significance for Romanticism in the West.

Herder showed that each historical epoch had its own intrinsic value and each nation its own character or 'soul'. . . . The National Romantics were mainly interested in the history of 'the people', the languages of 'the people', and culture of 'the people' in general. And 'the people' were seen as an organism unfolding its innate potentiality—exactly like nature and history. [Gaarder 1995 : 270]

This stance of Romanticism influenced the Dutch scholars, too. They were trying to find 'the people' and the language of 'the people' in their colony. Roorda defined Sundanese as an independent language, not a dialect of Javanese. He established the linguistic distance between the Sundanese and both Javanese and Malay. Sundanese became a language, no longer a dialect, in the eyes of Europeans. Moreover, he insisted on the importance of Sundanese language on scientific principles. He says :

People therefor see that Sundanese is considered rather as a vernacular by the aristocrats and never proposed same level as Javanese. Because of it, knowledge of Sundanese is of no less importance, not only for communication with the inhabitants of the Sundanese area, who do not understand Javanese, but also in purely linguistic terms. Sundanese is, like Javanese, a distinct, peculiar branch of language, and because of it, is of equal importance considered from a linguistic point of view. [Roorda in De Wilde 1841 : x–xi]

His metaphor of a tree shows that his idea of language is rooted in the thinking of Herder and the theory of evolution, though Darwin's book was not published until 1859.

The next step was differentiation from other *volken* (ethnicity). In 1842 Wolter Robert van Hoëwell, a clergyman in Batavia from 1836 to 1849 and co-founder of *Tijdschrift voor Nederlandsch-Indië*, presented the results of his research. In his incomplete article, "Onderzoek naar de oorzaken van het onderscheid in voorkomen, kleeding, zeden en gewoonten, taal en karakter tusschen de Soendanezen en eigenlijke Javanen" (Research into the reasons for the differences between the Sundanese and the Javanese proper in terms of appearance, dress, customs and traditions, language and character), he discusses in ethnographic term the distinction in physical features between *Djalma Soenda* (Sundanese people) and *Wong Jawa* (Javanese people). This article amounted to an recognition, not only of a linguistic entity, but also of the people living in western Java as a distinct ethnic group, "Soendanezen." It is of interest that the two went together : language and ethnicity. However, we should not overlook his remarkable argument for Sundanese : he described loan words from Malay and Arabic ; speech levels (he used the Javanese terms *kromo* and *ngoko*) ; the comparison with Javanese and Kawi ; the differences between Sundanese in Priangan and in Cirebon ; the alphabet borrowed from Javanese ; and so forth [Hoëwell 1842 : 139–145].

The most important event in the development of the study of Sundanese language was soon to occur. Pieter Mijer, the secretary of the Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen, announced a prize for a Sundanese dictionary on 9 October 1843: a big gold medal (or 300 guilders) and 1,000 guilders. After pointing out the incompleteness of De Wilde's Dutch-Sundanese dictionary, he announced the following requirements for the new dictionary :

An as comprehensive as possible Dutch-Sundanese dictionary in which Sundanese words appear in both Javanese and Latin characters ; explaining which words are the kromo-language and which words are the ngoko-language, and in which part of the Sundanese areas every word is used ; and clarifying the meanings of words with examples from daily life. [Mijer 1843 : x]

Why was this prize to be awarded? First of all, the colonial government became aware of the necessity of the study of indigenous languages for the sake of administration. As Dutch involvement deepened, direct contact with the indigenous people increased. However, knowledge of Sundanese was scarce, especially in comparison with Javanese. The idea of the prize was supported by the increasing interest of scholarship in a newly 'found' distinctive language. The Dutch officials required a more practical and comprehensive dictionary, because they considered De Wilde's dictionary as insufficient.

Besides the need for a new dictionary, the government drew attention to the need for textbooks and grammars in the same announcement. The government insisted that the study of Sundanese by Europeans was as useful in practical terms as the study of Javanese : in the interior of Java, Malay was incomprehensible to both Javanese and Sundanese [*ibid.* : v-vi]. It took two decades before this hope was fulfilled by P. Blussé in cooperation with the Sundanese Kartawinata, the son of Moehamad Moesa. Moesa (1823-1886) was an intimate friend of K. F. Holle and the chief Muslim leader in Limbangan (present-day Garut). The most significant effect of the announcement of the prize was the shared recognition of Sundanese as a distinct language in Java and it proved a stimulus for the study of Sundanese among Europeans.

The first Sundanese-foreign language dictionary (not the foreign language-Sundanese dictionary) came out in 1862, *A Dictionary of the Sunda Language of Java*. Its compiler, Jonathan Rigg, was an English tea planter who lived to the south of Buitenzorg. He had finished his work in 1854, 13 years after the publication of dictionary of De Wilde. Rigg's dictionary marks an epoch in the history of Sundanese language, showing once again that British succeeded in West Java, not the Dutch. It is not difficult to imagine the frustration felt by the Dutch towards the British. Although the Dutch had long been concerned with the East Indies and had studied them, the British, (Raffles and Crawfurd and here again Rigg) made the most important contribution to the scholarship of Sundanese language. Dutch scholars bitterly criticized the dictionary. For example, Daniel Koorders began his review of the book as follows :

It pained me much that the compiler was not a Dutchman ; that, just as the first man to give us a general view of the fundamental rules of our colonial policy was a foreigner, so, too, the first person to give us the practical means for the knowledge of the language of the people of Western Java was a foreigner. It surprised me that in a dictionary that should have been written mainly for Dutch people the spelling of the Sundanese words is according to the English pronunciation. [Koorders 1863: 1]

Koorders had doctorates in both theology and law and was sent to the Indies in 1862 as *Oost-Indies ambtenaar*, a high ranking official. He was ordered to study Sundanese and to establish a *Kweekschool* (Teachers' Training College). He was a Sundanese specialist at that time. A Dutch scholar's frustration against the British can be seen in this book review. At the beginning of the nineteenth century interest in the study of Asian ethnology was increasing among Europeans. In academic journals such as *Tijdschrift van Bataviaasch Genootschap* we find many articles about the ethnography of East and Southeast Asia since its early publication. The desire to know the various peoples and their own cultures was a natural incentive to study. British like Raffles, Crawfurd and Rigg, came to the East Indies and wrote books. Koorders concluded his review as follows :

In the light of the importance of the study of Sundanese, which could be taken down a completely wrong path by Rigg's book, I feel obliged to make a disapproving judgement [*ibid.* : 21]

Despite criticism Rigg's dictionary was the first Sundanese-foreign language, English not Dutch, dictionary. In the preface it is unusual that he did not attempt any lengthy explanation of the language. Seemingly, he thought no explanation was necessary to justify its status as an independent indigenous language of the island of Java, because the existence of Sundanese had already become common knowledge in the Dutch East Indies. Some seventy years after the first vocabulary list of 1780, Sundanese took up its own position as a language in European scholarship. In other words, it can be said that the period before Rigg's dictionary was the age of 'discovery' of Sundanese : Sundanese was 'discovered' and 'invented' as a distinct language on the island of Java by Europeans, notably, Dutch and English administrators and planters in West Java.

The following period was marked by the activities of missionaries and scholars. They tried to define what Sundanese was and attempted to establish orthodox/authoritative knowledge of the language. This period lasted until the 1880s when the divergence of opinion among missionaries and scholars was in the great part solved and the discussion was settled : dictionaries were compiled, grammar books were published and a spelling system was established. One of the most important discussions centred around which Sundanese was '*zuiver*' ('pure'). It is interesting that they assumed that every

language has a pure form. In the course of their publishing efforts the Dutchmen sought a 'pure' Sundanese. Believing that they had found it, they taught this 'pure' Sundanese as the standard language for Sundanese pupils in schools. Thus, first Sundanese was discovered by the Europeans and its supposed 'pure' form was determined as the standard language by Dutch scholars. Then it was taught to the native Sundanese. The process of the development of Sundanese was nothing but the implementation of a colonial language policy.

'Pure' Sundanese

Descriptive and normative studies are generally carried out first or chiefly by scholars outside the speech community and are therefore written in other languages [Ferguson 1959: 325–340]. Studies of Sundanese were undertaken by outside scholars, especially Dutch scholars and missionaries. In the 1860s the idea of Sundanese as a different language from Javanese became commonly accepted among Europeans. However, their knowledge of the 'newly found' native language was limited. They began to study on the island of Java itself. Protestant missionaries came to West Java for their own purposes and studied Sundanese mainly as part of their attempts to translate the Bible. Meanwhile, scholars who were sent by the government made dictionaries and grammar books. They were almost obsessed by the belief that every language has a pure form. It seems that such a belief was formed by the linguistic ideas which prevailed at the time among academic circles in Europe. For example, the idea of language presented by Wilhelm von Humboldt (1767–1835) who was one of the most influential linguist in Europe.⁹⁾

The idea of pure language also influenced Sundanese intellectuals of the time. One of the most influential Sundanese aristocrats and writers, Moehamad Moesa, attempted to purify his own language. He wrote in a poem in 1867:

Reja make doewa basa,	Many people are using two languages,
nja eta salah-sahidji,	namely they are,
Malajoe atawa Djawa,	Malay or Javanese,
nja bener hade teh teuing,	it is actually exceedingly good,
kaäsoep djalma radjin,	he can be said to be industrious,
ngarti Djawa djeung Malajoe,	[if he] can understand Javanese and Malay,
tatapi oelah tinggal,	but do not leave,
basa asal nini-aki,	the original language of [your] grandparents
mangka natrat basa asal toetoeroenan.	may the language of our ancestors endure.

9) Humboldt described old Javanese language in his book, *Über die Kawi-Sprache auf der Insel Java* (On Kawi language on the island of Java), in the late eighteenth century.

Kawoela soekoer ka Allah,
Goesti anoe sipat rahim,
sareh kersa noe kawasa,
Soenda dihoedangkeun deui,
oepama anoe gering,
ajeuna eukeur mamajoe,
ngan tatjan tjageur pisan,
manawa sakeudeung deui,
moega-moega sing toeleo djagdjag
waringkas.

I thank Allah,
Lord who is merciful,
by the wish of the ruler,
Sunda was woken up again,
like one who was ill,
now he is recovering,
but he has not yet recovered full health,
probably in a little while,
I hope he will be completely well again.

Anoe matak basa Soenda,
diseboetkeun hoedang gering,
tapi tatjan djagdjag pisan,
boekcina tatjan walagri,
basana tatjan bersih,
tjampoer Djawa djeung Malajoe,
soemawon basa Arab,
eta noe reja teh teuing,
malah aja noe enggeus leungit djinisna.

The reason why the Sundanese language can,
be said to be in the process of recovering,
but not yet completely healthy is,
its evidence that it is not yet fine,
the language is not yet pure,
mixed up with Javanese and Malay,
even with Arabic,
such words are exceedingly many,
in fact lost its origin.

[Moesa 1867 : 5]

According to Moesa, Sundanese was recently revived from a sick condition ("Soenda dihoedangkeun deui"). He means that Sundanese came to be regarded as not inferior to Javanese. In other words, it no longer belonged to Javanese as a dialect after it was distinguished as a separate language from Javanese by Europeans. Certainly, Moesa was well acquainted with the tradition of his own language. Sundanese has a corpus of writing and an oral tradition as well. He often thanked the Dutch or the colonial government in his writing because they raised the position of Sundanese to the same level of Javanese. Sundanese as a language originating from the ancestors ("basa asal nini-aki") was still in a weak condition in his eyes. He tried to persuade his people to think more of their mother tongue : "basana tatjan bersih" [the language is not yet pure] because it was mixed up with Javanese, Malay and even Arabic. Moesa was afraid of losing the purity of Sundanese language, because of interference from other languages. He asserted that Sundanese should be purified. The word "bersih" was often used in the nineteenth century in the context of defining 'good' language. It is likely that Moesa picked up the idea of purity of language from the Dutch. In those days Dutch scholars often talked about the '*zuiver*' language and translated it into the Malay word "bersih," which in fact, means rather 'clean' than 'pure'. 'Pure' in Malay is "murni." However both the Dutch and the Sundanese preferred to use "bersih" to denote purity of language

which was not mixed up with other languages and was free from pollution. Meanwhile the word “asli” (original) came into use around the turn of the century with regard to the languages and cultures of the Dutch East Indies. It is interesting that a prominent Muslim leader like Moehamad Moesa did not use an equivalent Sundanese word for the idea of ‘pure’ language. He had probably never thought in such a way about his own language. As Bakhtin suggests, people can objectivize their own particular language only when outsiders point it out to them. He simply imported a word from Malay — to him a foreign word — with its foreign idea of language.

One point needs to be made about the differences in the notions of ‘pure’ language held by Moesa and by the Dutch. ‘Pure’ Sundanese for Moesa was language in which there was not interference from Javanese and Malay, while for the Dutch ‘pure’ Sundanese meant a purer dialectal form of Sundanese. Missionaries and scholars were trying to settle on a ‘pure’ form for the standardization of the language. So their question was, which regional form of Sundanese is the correct and original? In the event, they decided that the Sundanese spoken in Bandung represented the ‘purest’ form.

We often hear that Sundanese people themselves claim the Sundanese in Cianjur to be the most mellifluous in terms of pronunciation. On the contrary, the Sundanese in Bogor and outside the Priangan Regencies is considered to be less refined in pronunciation and in morphological aspects. In the first half of the nineteenth century Cianjur prospered and had a relatively larger population than the other towns. In fact, Cianjur had been the administrative centre (*hoofdplaats*) of West Java up to 1864. The colonial government made Cianjur the capital of the Priangan Regencies mainly from the economic point of view. Cianjur occupies an important geographical position connecting the interior of West Java and Batavia. Agricultural produce such as coffee, which was collected from the plantations, was brought through Cianjur. However, parallel to the shift in the importance of the market economy, Bandung was becoming more important than Cianjur for the colonial government. In 1865 the capital of the Priangan Regencies was moved to Bandung for economic reasons, especially the changing of the transportation route for plantation produce [Ohashi 1994 : 87–114]. In fact, Bandung had functioned as the centre of the eastern part of Sunda region for a long time before this administrative move. This event led to accelerated centralization in many aspects. The population in Bandung began to increase rapidly and Bandung was fast becoming the centre of Sundanese culture and government [Antlov 1995 : 16–27 ; Kunto 1984]. However, Cianjur maintained its reputation in the cultural field. The Regent in Cianjur, R. A. Koesmanin-grat (Regent from 1834 to 1863), held a high reputation in the field of Sundanese culture. He was very fond of music and promoted it. This can be seen in the name of a musical genre, *tembang cianjuran*, still used today [Zanten 1989 : 21–23]. The language in Cianjur maintained its high reputation for *lemes* (soft, refined) Sundanese. In contrast, at the beginning of the nineteenth century Raffles had declared “in *Bogor* and *Chai-anjur*, the *Sunda* is pronounced in a more drawling manner than in *Cheribon*, where it is probably

most correctly spoken" [Raffles 1817: 358]. His remarks are understandable in that Raffles considered Sundanese as a mountain dialect of Javanese. Nowadays the language used in Cirebon, sometimes called Cirebonese, is linguistically a dialect of Javanese with a mixture of Javanese and Sundanese. In opposition to the British, the Dutch scholar Roorda defined the Sundanese-speaking area in exact terms in his introduction to the above-mentioned dictionary :

Geheel zuiver wordt het Soendasch gesproken in de geheele uitgestrektheid der Preanger Regentschappen, alsmede in Bantam en Cheribon, uitgezonderd alleen in het Bantamsche de strandbewoners naar den kant van straat Soenda, en in het Cheribonsche die, welke naar het noorden en dicht aan het Tegalsche wonen, daar in beide deze steken, gelijk veelal in grensgewesten, een gemengde tongval gesproken wordt. [Roorda in De Wilde 1841: v]

[Sundanese is spoken in completely pure form throughout the whole of the Priangan Regencies, as well as in Bantam and Cheribon, except among the Bantamese who inhabit the coast north of the Sunda strait and among the Cheribonese who live to the north, near the Tegalese. In these areas, both of which are boundary areas, a mixed accent is spoken.]

A language is spoken in a pure form : this idea was the key concept to define the language. However, Roorda did not specify which dialect was the purest. During the following three decades, various research was undertaken by missionaries such as S. Coolsma, A. Geerdink, C. Albers, D. J. van der Linden, G. J. Grashuis and W. H. Engelmann, and by scholars like D. Koorders, H. J. Oosting and J. R. P. F. Gonggrijp.¹⁰⁾ The colonial government pronounced in 1872 that Sundanese was spoken in its 'purest' form in Bandung. Bandung Sundanese, together with the Javanese spoken in Surakarta, the Batak in Mandheling and the Malay spoken in Malaka and island Riau, were determined as the languages of education in Dutch indigenous schools.¹¹⁾ Pure Sundanese was chosen and began to be taught in schools. This official statement was an epoch-making event in the development of the language. This represents a very colonial situation : a dialect of language was chosen by the colonial authority, not by the people who used the language themselves. The chosen languages were promoted as standard languages. As regards the standard languages, the colonial authority issued another statement in 1912. The same contents were repeated : Sundanese in Bandung was recognized as the standard language. It stated that :

10) On the development of the study of Sundanese see Uhlenbeck's survey [1964] and Van den Berge's detailed discussion [1993].

11) Art. 28. 'Onderwijs voor Inlanders, Reglement op het lager onderwijs voor Inlanders. Ordonnantie van 25 Mei 1872' in Tweede Afdeeling, Gouvernements Inlandsche scholen of Staatsblad 1872 no. 99.

Netepkeun palanggeran teh babakoena pisan noeroetkeun kana ngoenikeunana ketjap noe pangloembrahna dioenikeun dina basa anoe djadi loeloegoe (hoofddialect Soenda : Bandoeng, Malajoe : Riau, Djawa : Soerakarta). [Volkslectuur 1912]

[In making the rule, we principally follow the pronunciation of the words as they are most commonly pronounced in the standardized languages (chief dialect of Sundanese : Bandung, Malay : Riau, Javanese : Surakarta).]

In a sense 'correct' Sundanese was 'invented' by the Dutch. After the 'pure' Sundanese was found, the specific form of the language was constituted as unitary under the influence of scholars, lexicographers, grammarians and missionaries. They compiled dictionaries of 'pure' Sundanese words and systematized the language in grammar books. The language was confined in a deep freezer, so to speak, so that it could not change, whereas language is dynamic and always changing in itself. The authority of structure (political, narrative and syntactic) is socially constructed and historically changing. However, the development of it was confined in a chest of language. As a result, ironically, the language of such grammar books and dictionaries has come to be considered as the 'right' Sundanese by the Sundanese themselves up until the present day.

The above statement on the standard language was published in a booklet concerning spelling in Latin script [Spellingstelsels [1918]]. A system of spelling or transliteration is a good example of the 'invention' of the language. The Dutch created an alphabet for Sundanese in place of the existing script according to their own logic.

*Sundanese in Aksara Walanda (Latin Script)*¹²⁾

Before Latin script was introduced into the Sunda area in the nineteenth century by the Dutch, Sundanese was mostly written in Arabic script (the so-called *huruf Pegon*) and in the script borrowed from Javanese. Several centuries earlier the Sundanese had their own script, the so-called Old Sundanese script, in which lontar-manuscripts in the sixteenth century were written [Noorduyn 1962 ; Uhlenbeck 1964 : 16]. Following the introduction of Islam into Sunda in the fifteenth century, Arabic script was used in conjunction with Old Sundanese script. After the Javanese Mataram dynasty imposed its influence on the Sunda area from the seventeenth century, Javanese script took over the position of the predominant script. In particular, the Sundanese *menak* (local aristocrats) came to use both Javanese language and script under Javanese cultural and political influence. They had to bring tribute to the Javanese court. Javanese culture became superior and necessary for Sundanese cultivated aristocrats. The Javanese literary tradition, which was considered more refined or 'higher', entered the Sundanese literary

12) Part of the material in this section has been dealt with in my article "Language policy in the Dutch colony : On Sundanese in the Dutch East Indies" in Moriyama [1995].

tradition as much as Javanese language and script. It is natural that the Dutch found Sundanese aristocrats using Javanese language and script rather than their own Old Sundanese script, when the Priangan Regencies were surrendered to the Dutch colonial government/VOC by the Mataram dynasty in 1755 as a result of defeat in the Java War. Thus Javanese rule over the Sundanese was merely one hundred years. During this time the Old Sundanese script had been losing its position in Sundanese writing, while Arabic script was being used more and more in parallel with Javanese script.

When the Dutch colonial government started concerning the Sundanese area actively after the British interregnum, they found two kinds of local script, i. e. Javanese and Arabic. The former was used by *menak* who were in government and politics. It is thought that the use of Javanese was limited to the elite. However, they were using Arabic script at the same time. They changed their script to suit the writing: Arabic script was common for almost all kinds of writing, whereas Javanese script was used for official reports submitted to the Javanese Mataram dynasty and later to the Dutch government, and for their correspondence, as we have seen earlier in this section. It is not difficult to imagine how a misunderstanding by the Dutch came about: the Dutch thought Javanese script was the dominant local script because they mostly had contact only with the *menak*. It is possible that they were biased towards the view that the Priangan Regencies were a part of the Javanese Mataram dynasty, so the idea of "berg-Javaans" (mountain Javanese) can be understood. On the basis of these false impressions and in a sense ignorance, the language policy was implemented. That is to say, Javanese and Latin script were to be used for Sundanese language in the education of local people: no Arabic script was taken into account in spite of its popularity in society.

This popularity is supported by reference to the catalogue of Sundanese manuscripts compiled by Ekadjati [1988]. It lists 488 manuscripts collected in domestic public collections and 789 in collections abroad, mostly in Leiden University library, and 554 which are still in private hands in West Java. The majority of manuscripts in domestic collections are written in Arabic script and very rarely in Javanese, while in Leiden the number of manuscripts in Javanese is nearly the same as that in Arabic. The second point is that Sundanese manuscripts in Latin script are not uncommon both in domestic collections and in collections abroad. They are considered to be the result of intensive contact with the Dutch. The number of Latin script manuscripts supports the assumption that manuscript culture was steadily continuing in a different channel from print culture. Moreover, printed books were sometimes copied by hand, so that a new tradition was created. This shows how strong the tradition of manuscript culture was and how dominant the tendency of orality was in the society, because manuscript is usually intoned or recited and illiterate audience are listening to. Thirdly, a number of manuscripts written in Javanese and using Javanese script can be found. If we limit our discussion only to manuscripts written in Sundanese, Javanese ones should be out of our

consideration, even though the authors were Sundanese. The question is why are there so many Sundanese-language manuscripts in Javanese script in Leiden, while there are so few in Indonesia. Moreover, there are almost no Javanese-script manuscripts held in private collections. Most likely the Javanese script manuscripts were collected by the Dutch on the basis of their conception of Sundanese. Actually, in those days manuscripts were purchased and it stimulated people to produce manuscripts, especially using Javanese script, to earn money. The prime Dutch collector was Snouck Hurgronje. He collected about 400 Sundanese manuscripts for the Leiden collection. The others are Hazeu (52), Rinkes (36), Koorders (35), Taco Roorda (8) and the Netherlands Bible Society (NBG : Nederlands Bijbel Genootschap) (117), and other minor individual collectors. Thus, it is doubtful whether the collection in Leiden reflects the actual state of manuscript writing. On the contrary, it can be said that the domestic collections reflect the state of things as they really were, even though about 80 percent of the collection in the National Library in Jakarta was compiled by the Dutchmen K. F. Holle and C. M. Pleyte. These two Dutch gentlemen had intensive contact with the people and were always trying to find Sundanese culture as it was before Javanese influence affected it. They were also trying to enlighten the people and improve their welfare. Judging from the catalogue of Ekadjati, Arabic script was predominant in Sundanese society before Latin script was introduced.

Another reason why Arabic was not to be used for writing Sundanese in local schools was Holle's fear of Islam. He, who was the advisor on indigenous affairs and one of the main collectors of manuscripts, undoubtedly knew that the people could read and write Arabic better than Javanese script. However, he suggested to the colonial government that Javanese and Latin script should be used in education in the Sundanese region. He insisted all the time that Islamic elements should be avoided in government education in the Sunda region and the people in Batavia followed his advice faithfully. The implementation of the language policy went on along the lines of Holle's suggestion at least until 1880.

The decree of 1852 about indigenous education stated that two languages and three kinds of script should be used in schools in the Priangan Regencies : Sundanese in Javanese script and Malay in both Arabic and Latin script. Starting with this regulation, Sundanese adapted to the Latin script quite fast. In comparison with the Javanese, the Sundanese had made an earlier move towards the use of Latin script.¹³⁾ After 1900 books in Sundanese using Javanese script were seldom printed. Meanwhile, Arabic was hardly used in government publications from the beginning.¹⁴⁾ Official reports on education

13) Javanese script in Central Java was used in printed material at least up to the Japanese occupation [Molen 1991].

14) Books in Arabic script (around 10 books) were mostly published by local publishers such as Sayyid Utman's printing house and they were often used in private (Islamic) schools.

observed that it was difficult for pupils to read Sundanese in Latin script in the early years of the introduction of European education [VIO 1865 : 13].¹⁵⁾ Javanese and Arabic scripts proved easier. However, Ahmad Djajadiningrat, who was a well-known aristocrat and wrote about his upbringing in his autobiography,¹⁶⁾ said that “Na eenige weken kon ik vrij behoorlijk lezen en vrij netjes met potlood schrijven” [Within a few weeks I was able to read quite possibly and to write neatly with a pencil] [Djajadiningrat 1936 : 24].¹⁷⁾ Before he left home to go to a Dutch school for aristocrats children, he was ordered by his father to go to a private school at Pandeglang in Banten Regency around 1887. There he received private lessons in writing and reading *huruf Belanda* (Dutch script). As was common, Ahmad had already learned Arabic script by reading the Koran at a *pesantren* (Islamic school). It is possible that he was taught Javanese script at home as part of upbringing of an aristocrat. His episode suggests that learning Latin script seems to have been not so difficult for children who had already learned other scripts, even though the official report said Latin script was difficult for children. The ease of using Latin script in itself could help to replace Javanese script. However, it can not be denied that Ahmad's case was exceptional, because he was more clever than most children and talented in languages.

Although Holle insisted on the use of Javanese script as well as Latin script, it was the latter that was promoted as the Government choice as time went on. Latin script became the dominant or even the sole script for Sundanese in print, whereas Arabic script had been written and read in the manuscript tradition. It was not easy to replace the texts in the manuscript, especially Islamic ones, with Latin script. Arabic script in the manuscript was therefore used in parallel with Latin script in print. Another type of script literacy was destined to live on in the manuscript world. Meanwhile, the tradition of using Javanese script for Sundanese was discontinued : people stopped reading manuscripts in Javanese script and were unconcerned about this loss. In short, Javanese was replaced by Latin script and Arabic script continued to be used parallel with it.

The next question was how to transliterate Sundanese into Latin script. The Dutch created a system of transliteration from Javanese script, not from Arabic, to Latin script. The attempt was made in accordance with the Government's language policy and stemmed from the necessity for Bible translation. In the process of transliteration the characteristic vowel 'eu' was a matter for debate. Sometimes the Dutch living in West

15) Official reports from the Dutch Colonial government were sent to The Hague to assure the home government and the parliament that the governing was in good order. Those reports on printing worked sufficiently to convince the people in the motherland. We have to be aware of the performative feature of official reports.

16) See [Watson 1993] for an intriguing article regarding A. Djajadiningrat and his autobiography.

17) His autobiography was published in Indonesian by Balai Poestaka and published in Dutch by Kolff-Buning.

Java transliterated without deep consideration, but rendered the Sundanese words in Latin script according to their aural perception of them.

In 1862, Holle suggested using Latin script in certain cases, in spite of his strong preference for Javanese script, and also proposed an orthography. He published the first Latin spelling book for Sundanese, *Tjatjarakan Soenda*. He pointed out the difference in sound between the so-called long *pepet* and short *pepet*. Koorders negatively referred to Holle's method of spelling in his bitter critique of Rigg's dictionary in the newspaper *Java Bode* [Koorders 1863: 3, 9]. Like Koorders, the talented W. H. Engelmann, who was a translator attached to the Dutch East Indies by the Netherlands Bible Society (NBG), also wrote a critique of Holle's system in his correspondence with NBG in 1866 [Engelmann 1867].¹⁸⁾ Engelmann did not follow Holle's method of spelling the *pepet*. He proposed using 'e' for short *pepet* and 'eu' for long *pepet* in Latin script. It seems that Holle recognized the inadequacy of his method and later accepted Engelmann's suggestions. One year later, when the Engelmann correspondence was published, Grashuis, a missionary of the Netherlands Missionary Union (NZV : Nederlands Zendingvereniging) and later the first lecturer in Sundanese in Leiden, made a comparative study of transliteration [Grashuis 1870]. He also drew special attention to the two *pepet*. His proposed solution was very different from the others' (Rigg, De Wilde, Holle, Koorders, Engelmann). He acknowledged seven vowels in Sundanese, and used 'u' for the long *pepet*.

After ample deliberation, the Colonial Government adopted Holle's transliteration of Sundanese which was devised in 1871¹⁹⁾ [Holle 1871 : 94]. In fact, Holle's system was based in part on that of Engelmann. Two years later a missionary of the NZV, S. Coolsma, published a grammar of Sundanese using, unwillingly, the official transliteration. In 1884 an extensive Sundanese grammar book was published. The author, H. J. Oosting, was Koorders' successor. He confidently described the Sundanese vowels : "The vowels of the Javano-Sundanese alphabet are these : a , eu, i, oe, e, and o," even though he preferred to use Javanese script rather than transliterating in to Latin script [Oosting 1884 : 5]. In the 1880s the official orthography gained ground and found a secure foothold.

The development of spelling was reflected in the printing of Sundanese books.²⁰⁾ A Government institution for printing (the Landsdrukkerij), which developed and became the printing house of the Commissie voor de Volkslectuur, had printed Sundanese books since 1853. This organization had used the script for printing Sundanese following Holle's

18) His correspondence was collected and published because he died before the results of his research could be published. He was considered to have a talent for language and NBG regretted his death. NBG thought that his knowledge of Sundanese rivalled Holle's.

19) Uhlenbeck says, "A spelling system for Sundanese with Roman characters was devised by Holle with the help of Engelmann in 1873" [Uhlenbeck 1964 : 10]. I can not find the article of 1873. That article, it seems, was in fact that of 1871 which I have mentioned.

20) However, printed books in the second half of the nineteenth century were mostly school-books, not for adults.

initial recommendation and always tried to adapt their publications to the new orthography. Finally, but not officially, in 1912 the Commissie voor de Volkslectuur (Balai Poestaka) published a handbook for writing Sundanese in Latin script (*Palanggeran noeliskeun basa Soenda koe aksara Walanda*) for their Sundanese publications as a result of the consensus among Dutch and Sundanese specialists. The specialists were agricultural expert H. C. H. de Bie; teacher at the Gymnasium Willem III and Sundanese ethnologist C. M. Pleyte; and four Sundanese intellectuals who played an important role in Sundanese literature.²¹⁾ After a while, in 1918 a Dutch Government decree concerning *Inlandsche talen* (indigenous languages) was issued. It is remarkable that once again Dutchmen helped to determine rules for Sundanese language. The Sundanese orthography was officially proclaimed:

In recent years, it has seemed desirable for the spelling of the indigenous languages which are written in Latin script, to be settled precisely, especially for the benefit of the education. [Spellingstelsels [1918]: 1]

In this same handbook, the Sundanese vowel 'eu' is given as a good example of how to transliterate sounds of indigenous words which do not exist in Dutch. This handbook was translated into Malay, Javanese and Sundanese respectively.

In choosing the scripts and signs, in the first place account is taken of the equivalents they have in Dutch. When a certain sound does not exist in the latter language, the equivalent sign in Dutch which is as close as possible to the native vernacular is used. For example, the so-called long *pepet* in Sundanese, which is not encountered in Dutch, is represented by *eu*, since the sound represented by this sign indicates that of the Sundanese approximately. [*ibid.*: 2]

This statement gives us the impression that Sundanese orthography was developed for the use of the Dutch and for those who knew Dutch and with the assumption that Dutch was superior to the *Inlandsche* (indigenous) languages: moreover, Dutch was to be the universal standard to transliterate them. Thus, the 'eu' transliteration represents only an approximate sound of the so-called long *pepet* in Sundanese. The real sound is not same as the Dutch 'eu' sound, even though the spelling is still used in the present Sundanese orthography.

To sum up, transliteration of Sundanese from Javanese script into Latin was discussed and 'invented' by the Dutch between the 1860s and the 1880s. The orthography was made on the basis of Dutch logic: in the education of the uncivilized Sundanese Latin script was better than the existing script, i. e. Javanese and Arabic. The Dutch did not

21) The four Sundanese were M. Moehamad Rais, M. Partadiredja, D. Ardiwinata and M. Amongpradja.

value the opinion of the Sundanese themselves because they believed that they knew Sundanese better than the Sundanese themselves.

First the Dutch made a distinction between Sundanese and Javanese. Then they attempted to find a 'pure' Sundanese and invented an orthography for the language. In fact, the Dutch-made-orthography was convenient for the Dutch administrators who had responsibility for the Sunda region. The orthography was imposed upon the Sundanese people through Dutch schools and schoolbooks. If Latin script was only for use by the Dutch not the Sundanese, it could be seen as reasonable. However, the colonial authority imposed their language policy upon the Sundanese themselves by way of education.

The missionaries did likewise for their own purposes, too. They compiled wonderful dictionaries and wrote orthodox prescriptive grammar books. However, they did not think seriously about the effects of their language policy. They translated the Bible and gospels mostly using Latin script.²²⁾ For the missionaries Javanese script was preferred to Arabic script because the latter was associated with Islam, but gradually Latin script became more predominant in their publications. It can be said that their contribution to Sundanese studies was valuable in academic terms, but ironically they did not succeed in propagating Christianity in the Sunda region. This can be explained not only by the influence of Holle on the government policy against propagating Christianity in West Java in order not to encourage 'fanatic' Muslims, but also by missionaries' misunderstanding of Sundanese culture.

From the Sundanese point of view, the newly 'invented' orthography was not rejected. They did not feel proud of their existing script. It can be said that they were ready to receive the new script and there was hardly any resistance to Dutch language policy. The Sundanese were willing to accept European education to serve their own interest and were not afraid of losing Javanese and Arabic script in return for accepting Latin. However, not only script and orthography were created and imposed by the Dutch: the 'correct' Sundanese, which was formulated in grammar books, and 'pure' words which were compiled in dictionaries, were also created. The Sundanese that was 'invented' by the Dutch during the second half of nineteenth century came to be considered as the 'correct' Sundanese by the people themselves. If the clever Master thought it was correct, then it was impossible that it could be false, they seem to have thought. It is quite strange that Sundanese people nowadays consider the language recorded in grammar books and dictionaries during that time to be '*asli*' ('original') Sundanese. In fact, the form of the Sundanese language was formulated by the Dutch.

22) Only three translations made by Coolsma were published in Arabic script, because it was known that Arabic script would be read by the Sundanese.

II The 'Literature'

No Writing?

The Europeans in the Indies seemed to harbour the idea that each people has a distinct language and a distinct culture. Some cultures are advanced and some are backward; some cultures are higher than others. One criteria used to measure a culture's level of advancement was whether or not it had a 'literature'.

European scholars who were influenced by Romantic ideas of the nineteenth century hoped to find a particular kind of 'literature' in the writing of Sundanese. However, they seem to have had only a vague idea of what constitutes 'literature'. Their assumption was that 'literature' is something lofty, something to be gathered in canonical works. Moreover, of course, such 'literature' had to be written down.

In fact, these scholars failed to find what they were looking for and were disappointed by what they found. This was because they were applying totally foreign expectations and lacked knowledge. Most of them were not really trying to understand 'others', but were measuring them against a Western standard. In the process of formulating Western perceptions of Sundanese language, one of the earliest presumptions was that the Sundanese had no 'literature'.

In this section I will try to define the reason why the Europeans found no 'literature' in the Sundanese-speaking areas. The failure was due to the vastly different notions of what constitutes 'literature' held by the Europeans and the Sundanese. From the European point of view, writing in Sundanese did not seem to have an artistic dimension. Furthermore, the Europeans, completely oriented to writing, failed to notice the literary tradition of the Sundanese: orally transmitted literature was invisible to them. The Sundanese had no 'literature' and therefore they had a low level of cultural advancement, their culture was less developed than the European.

As we saw in the previous section, Europeans began to take the indigenous culture seriously just after the beginning of the nineteenth century. With regard to indigenous literature as well as language, the British played an important role. Crawfurd maintained that, "There are no books in the Sunda language, for the Sunda has no national literature" [Crawfurd 1820 : Vol. 2, 68]. He recognized Sundanese as a distinct language, but he could find no writing in it. Another Englishman, Rigg, who had compiled the first Sundanese-English dictionary, did not find a Sundanese literature either. He wrote in the preface to his dictionary, "The Sunda people possess no literature to which reference can be made, and it is consequently a purely oral language spoken by a little better than two millions of people" [Rigg 1862 : xiii]. It is obvious that Crawfurd and Rigg considered 'literature' to consist of something written, as the word's etymology would indicate. Also, the common understanding at the time that the materials written down by the Sundanese

were in the Javanese language supported Rigg's observation. There is no 'literature' without writing and no 'literature' can be written in a "purely oral language." In fact, they were misinformed. There were indeed Sundanese texts written on palm leaves (*lontar*) and on paper, as we have mentioned earlier.

The expert on the languages of the Indies, Roorda, also found nothing worthy of calling 'literature'. Although he had legitimated Sundanese as a distinct language in West Java, he did not think it likely that the Sundanese had a 'literature':

Van eene eigene Soendasche literatuur heeft de Heer de Wilde, gedurende zijn veeljarig verblijf in de Preanger Regentschappen nimmer iets vernomen, zoodat het niet waarschijnlijk is, dat er zulk eene bestaat. [Roorda in De Wilde 1841: xi]

[Mr. de Wilde, was never informed about an indigenous Sundanese literature during his many years stay in the Preanger Regencies, so that it is not probable that any such exists.]

Roorda's notions of Sundanese literature were formed on the basis of the materials collected by De Wilde.²³⁾ Since Roorda had never been to the Indies, this was the only way he could be informed. On the other hand, he considered that the Javanese had a lofty literary tradition and he was himself well acquainted with the Javanese manuscripts collected and sent to the Netherlands. He therefore concluded that Javanese culture was higher than Sundanese, because the former had writing.

In opposition to both De Wilde and Roorda, another contemporary scholar, H. Neubronner van der Tuuk, held a completely different notion of 'literature'. He was an expert in several indigenous languages. He asserted that Sundanese was an independent language and had "meenak woorden" (words of aristocrats; upperclass vocabulary) and "koerieng woorden" (words of common people), a distinction he considered equivalent to the Javanese *kromo-ngoko* speech levels. During a period of recuperation from an illness at Buitenzorg (Bogor), he obtained Sundanese manuscripts, including religious books, epic poetry, and letters. He criticized De Wilde as follows:

Dat er volstrekt geen Sundanesche litteratuur zou bestaan, zoo als De Wilde vermeldt, is geheel onjuist, en ik geloof, dat hierover nog weinig stelligs te zeggen valt, zoo lang de beschaafde (en dit zijn in den regel de meest godsdienstige) Mahommedanen ongenegen zijn aan ons ongeloo-vingen te laten zien, wat zij van letterkunde bezitten, uit vreeze, dat te moeten afstaan of verontreinigd te zien. [Tuuk 1851: 341]

23) It is strange that no Sundanese writing was found by De Wilde, who lived such a long time among Sundanese people as a planter. As a matter of fact, there existed a number of manuscripts written in Sundanese in those days.

[That absolutely no Sundanese literature exists, as De Wilde mentions, is completely incorrect, and I believe that we will still have little to say about it with certainty as long as the cultivated (who are, as a rule, the most pious) Muslims are unwilling to show us unbelievers what sort of literature they possess, for fear of having to hand it over or of having it contaminated.]

This was written ten years after De Wilde's dictionary was published. Van der Tuuk seemed to maintain that where there is a language, there is a literature. Every people has a language and every language has a culture and every language has a literature. This was probably a sign of the wind of Romanticism blowing through the Netherlands at the beginning of the nineteenth century [Bork 1986 : 43–116]. However, what Van der Tuuk means by "litteratuur" does not exactly correspond to 'literature', but rather to writing, something written down in Sundanese.

Van der Tuuk's doubt about De Wilde's position based on the reluctance of Sundanese to show the Dutch their writings for religious reasons are probably well-founded. Many Sundanese-language manuscripts were written in Arabic script, as we have seen from Ekadjati's catalogue, and people often thought of manuscripts as sacred or holy objects (*pusaka*), just as a dagger (*keris*) can be. Van der Tuuk also reported that the Sundanese had Javanese-language manuscripts written in Arabic script. Whatever the language, when a text was written in Arabic script, it had to be protected from contamination. However, in the first half of the nineteenth century, the Europeans could not distinguish Sundanese-language manuscripts from Javanese-language ones, because both were written in both Javanese and Arabic script. The indigenous Sundanese script had been lost.

Holle's work represented a turning point.²⁴⁾ He came to the Indies in 1843 and started to study Sundanese language and culture from the time he became a government clerk in 1846. He came to love Sundanese culture, and when he retired from government service and started a tea plantation in Cikajang (in the present-day Garut district) in 1856, he became deeply involved in its study and decided to devote himself to the 'enlightenment' of the Sundanese. In Holle's view, the Sundanese used Sundanese as an oral medium, but used Javanese as a written medium. According to him, the writing of manuscripts on palm-leaf had been lost. He wished to revive Sundanese as a language defining Sundanese culture. Thus, he wrote :

The writing of manuscripts for posterity is presently completely unknown and, firstly, since for some years now they have been written in Sundanese, instead of faulty Javanese. Yes, I still remember the response of a regent when I told him that the *panghulu* (Islamic leader) of Garut had composed a Sundanese poem, *wawacan* : "That is impossible : Sundanese is not a language (*boekan bahasa*) !" [Holle 1867 : 451]

24) Van den Berge has been doing research on K. F. Holle. See [Berge 1993] for an extended account of Holle's career, esp. pp. 11 – 30.

Of course, he was misinformed, since manuscripts were being written at the time that Van der Tuuk found them in Buitenzorg. The experience of Holle's friend, Engelmann, also contradicts Holle's impression. Engelmann had reported in a letter to the Netherlands Bible Society in 1865 that he and Holle had found three Sundanese manuscripts in an isolated village, Tjiboeroej near Garut. He wished to learn Sundanese from manuscripts in order to compile a Sundanese dictionary and he intended to publish the texts since he considered them valuable from the scholarly point of view. He wrote that he had already learned *Tjarita Sama'oem*, *Tjarita Radja Habib*, *Tjarita Radja Hindik*, *Tjarita Radja Djoengdjoeman* and five other stories [Veth 1869 : 259–261]. Van den Berge has noted in reaction to the quote from Holle above that “it seems as if a language was created under the supervision of a Dutchman” [1993 : 17]. Indeed, it seems that a Dutchman may have created not only a language, but a literature, too.

Holle set about to educate the Sundanese people. He suggested to literate Sundanese aristocrats that they write stories in Sundanese. His friend, Moehamad Moesa, was one of the most productive of those who took up his suggestion. The texts which Holle selected and edited as schoolbooks were published with government funds by the government printing office, Landsdrukkerij. In the 1860s, 23 such books were published by the government under Holle's supervision. No one was talking at that time of whether a Sundanese ‘literature’ existed. The matter at hand was which writing should be chosen as suitable to publish for use in schools. There was no talk of verbal art in Sundanese, either. The purpose of publishing texts in Sundanese was not to edit manuscript materials, considered to be valuable from a scholarly point of view, as Engelmann and others had attempted, but, rather, to publish schoolbooks. The main goal of the Dutch government authorities was to control the people and to raise their ‘level of civilization’. Research on language and literature was therefore not done for academic purpose, but more practical reasons. The results were to be used for the implementation of colonial policy.

The Government commissioned D. Koorders to evaluate the schoolbooks then in use in 1863. Koorders was a scholar and immediately came into conflict with the autodidact Holle, so pragmatic in his method. Koorders' evaluation of Holle's works were mostly negative : he deemed them unsuitable for the purpose of teaching Sundanese language to the Sundanese people for a number of reasons. He judged that since most of the texts were written in verse (*dangding*), they were unsuitable for teaching a pure form of the language [Meinsma 1869 : 260–264]. Koorders had no expectation that the indigenous peoples of the Indies had any ‘literature’ equivalent to that in Dutch. The criteria of his evaluation of Sundanese printed books were whether the contents were sufficiently didactic and whether the language usage was correct. He did not attempt to evaluate the texts from the literary point of view at all. Romantic notions of verbal art were not at work here ; as a colonial official he felt that the Dutch were obliged to teach the Sundanese proper Sundanese language. Thus, the Dutch knew Sundanese better than

the Sundanese people themselves.

Also during the 1860s the Nederlandsche Zendingsvereeniging in Rotterdam published a spelling book and three arithmetic books in Sundanese for use in mission schools. They also published a translation by Grashuis of the *Gospel According to Luke* (*Kitab Indjil dikarang koe Loekas*) in 1866. Thus, both Dutch colonial officials and missionaries were busy creating a corpus of Sundanese writing.

No 'Literature'?

After having first discovered writing in Sundanese, Dutch scholars began to discuss its artistic merits. They were in search of 'literature' in these writings. But their search was in vain, because their notion of 'literature' was so vastly different. They therefore concluded that Sundanese writing was worthless from the 'literary' point of view.

It was Grashuis who began to talk again of the art of Sundanese writing after the topic had been abandoned, having been first raised by Van der Tuuk. It is noteworthy that Van der Tuuk, who said that theoretically writing in Sundanese existed, used the terms "litteratuur" and "letterkunde" interchangeably without distinguishing between them. At the beginning of the nineteenth century "letterkunde" was the common word to mean more or less 'literature', although the concept of 'literature' itself was vague. Meanwhile "litteratuur" was the new word borrowed from French ("litterature") with the newly established meaning of 'literature'. However, the concept of literature was itself a relative newcomer to European civilization in the nineteenth century. To the Dutch in the nineteenth century, the French were superior to them with respect to language and culture. They accepted the French term "litterature" without establishing a clear definition, presuming that there was something self-evident about it and losing sight of its ideological nature. "Letterkunde" became "litteratuur" and vice versa in Holland without having a clear definition of literature. Dutch scholars tried to adapt their notion of 'literature' to the indigenous writing although they did not have a clear definition of the term. Neither Van der Tuuk nor Grashuis found 'literature'.

Grashuis was initially sent to West Java as a Bible translator and later, in 1877, appointed as a lecturer of Sundanese language at Leiden University. He came to find "litteratuur" in Sundanese writing, in the sense of "geschriften" but, failed to find any artfulness therein. In his words, "[Sundanese writings] are all lacking in artistic merit" [*zij alle kunstwaarde missen*]. He continued as follows, in his introduction to an anthology of Sundanese writings, *Soendanesche Bloemlezing*:

Though they are important from a linguistic point of view, they have no claim as artistic products of literature. The poetry is just rhyming and the prose never gets off the ground.
[Grashuis 1881 : xi]

Grashuis's position on Sundanese writing remained consistent from the first anthol-

ogy he published in 1874. There he claimed that Sundanese poetry was a mere imitation of Javanese poetry, lacked any artistic value, showing only the deep influence of Islam on the Sundanese [Grashuis 1874: iv]. Besides poetry, the Sundanese had very few prose writings and they were merely meant as didactic aids.

According to Grashuis, art and science had never flourished in the Sundanese-speaking area of Java because since the fall of Pajajaran the Sundanese lacked kingdoms and palaces that could function as cultural centres and rulers who could patronize the arts.²⁵⁾ He was always comparing Javanese language and literature with the Sundanese. Constantly he found the latter inferior.

It is pity that Grashuis could not find any artistic merit in Sundanese writing and could not enjoy the writing that he found, despite his obviously excellent command of the language. How painful it must have been to read so many writings without emotion or excitement and only to react at the linguistic level. But, such an attitude was considered to be the proper academic posture for Dutch scholars of the time to take.

Although Grashuis was of the opinion that the Sundanese had no “literary products of art” [*litterarische kunstvoorbrenghelen*], he compiled three different anthologies of Sundanese writing from the corpus of texts available to him.²⁶⁾ He did so for the sake of enrichment of knowledge about indigenous languages in the Indies. “Sundanese language is no less worthy an object of study as Javanese,” he announced in the introduction to the first anthology [*ibid.* : xiii]. He meant his books to be textbooks for anyone who wanted to learn the language of West Java, in particular the aspiring colonial officials who were trained in Delft, and later in Leiden. Such textbooks had to provide examples of correct usage of the language. Literary texts were expected to be lofty and graceful, moving and artful in their use of the language, on the other hand. Grashuis’s anthologies emphasized the pragmatic selection of ‘pure’ Sundanese, that is, Sundanese that was relatively free from the influence of other languages, such as Javanese, Malay and Dutch. Whereas for Grashuis’s predecessors, purity was more a matter of choosing a more refined dialect of Sundanese from among several varieties. He also claimed to choose texts that were ‘original’ in their style, though what criteria he used to determine originality is not clear.

In his anthologies, Grashuis also aimed for variety. He selected letters, fables and Islamic tales from manuscript sources, and stories from printed books, including a Sundanese translation of Defoe’s *Robinson Crusoe*. He did not include many poems in his anthologies, because he felt that students could not learn correct language use from

25) Palaces (*kraton*) played an important role in nurturing local culture in the Archipelago. Language studies in the nineteenth century in the Dutch East Indies were carried out in and around such cultural centres [Putten 1995: 53].

26) They were *Soendaneesch leesboek* published in 1874, *Soendanesche bloemlezing. Fabelen, brieven en verhalen* in 1881 and *Soendanesche bloemlezing. Legendes en Moslimsche leerboekjes* in 1891. All of them were published by A. W. Sijthoff in Leiden.

poetry. He did, however, include a kind of narrative poetry called *wawacan*. Although *wawacan* was in fact quite popular among the Sundanese and mastering its style and language was important for learning Sundanese language, Grashuis included a few fragments of *wawacan* basically only for purposes of comparison, because he steadfastly maintained that poetry was not suitable for learning language. He also apparently saw little artfulness in *wawacan*. In the introduction to a later anthology, he remarked that “welke eene diep kloof er gaapt tusschen onze poëzie en die der Soendanezen” [there is a deep gap between our poetry and Sundanese poetry], for one is art and the other is not [Grashuis 1891 : v–vi].

Grashuis's opinions of Sundanese writing came to be commonly accepted. They were, for instance, taken up in the *Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch Oost-Indië*, which was published in four volumes from 1896 to 1905 and revised in eight volumes from 1917 to 1939. The voluminous Encyclopedia of the Dutch East Indies wrapped up the views and knowledge of the Dutch scholars and officials who were concerned with their East Indies, Sundanese 'language' and 'literature' included. Encyclopedia, in general, embodies common sense, the consensus at a certain period. The encyclopedia was taken as the authoritative reference work and it was an official project concerning the Indies. Men could find out anything from those bulky encyclopedia. By referring to a passage in one of them, a person could usually convince others immediately. The encyclopedia still has magical power to overcome any problems and answer any questions. Once a statement obtained its authoritative acknowledgement, and was quoted again and again, it came to admit of no argument. Under the entry for “Soendaneesch,” the encyclopedia had this to say :

Geen wonder dus dat de Soendanees voorheen geene eigenlijk gezegde *literatuur* heeft kunnen voortbrengen. Wel is hij er echter allengs toe gekomen om, in navolging van de nieuwere Javaansche poëzie, in zijn eigen taal *dichtstukken* of liever gezegd *rijm werken* op te stellen. Deze missen echter alle kunstwaarde en strekken alleen ten bewijze van den invloed, nu reeds bijna vier eeuwen lang, door den Islam op den bewoner van het Soendaneesche deel van Java uitgeoefend. [*Encyclopaedie* 1905 : Vol. 4, 20 ; 1921 : Vol. 4, 22–23]

[It is no wonder then that in the past the Sundanese could not have produced what is properly called *literature*. Sundanese writers gradually came to imitate the newer Javanese poetry in the production of *verse pieces* or more accurately, *doggerel*. However, these lack any artistic value and are noteworthy only as evidence of the influence of Islam on the inhabitants of the Sundanese part of Java over the course of four centuries.]

This entry from the 1905 edition was not revised in the 1921 edition : it was repeated word for word. Thus, the official opinion of Sundanese literature had not changed from the nineteenth century until 1921. The reason was perhaps the lack of Dutch experts. In

any case, because of the authoritativeness of the encyclopedia as a reference work, this view of Sundanese literature came to be commonplace.

It was up to Memed Sastrahadiprawira, the most respected and most famous Sundanese intellectual of the time, to challenge this view in an article in *Djawa*, the journal of the Java Instituut, “Over de waardeering der Soendaneesche litteratuur” (On the evaluation of Sundanese literature):

1e. het oordeel van Grashuis, . . . , als zouden de Soendaneezen geen eigenlijk gezegde literatuur hebben, niet overeenstemt met de werkelijkheid ;

2e. dat de meening, als zouden de bestaande dichtwerken alle kunstwaarde missen, van onvoldoende kennis van den beoordeelaar getuigt, waardoor het hem niet mogelijk was het schoone te genieten, mede vanwege den eigenaardigen maatstaf, welken hij aanlegde.

In een Encyclopaedie vervatte dwalingen hebben een taai leven, doch wij *blijven* hopen op een oordeel, zoo mogelijk op een waardeeling, gegrond op diepgaande *kennis* en liefdevol *verstaan*. [Sastrahadiprawira 1929 : 21]

[1st. Grashuis’s judgement, . . . , that the Sundanese have no real literature in the proper sense of the term is inconsistent with the truth ;

2nd. The statement that existing verse pieces are totally lacking artistic value was made on the basis of the insufficient knowledge of the evaluator, who could therefore not appreciate anything beautiful [in those words], in addition to account of the special measuring, which he laid out.

In the Encyclopaedia errors have a persistent life, but we *maintain* the hope that a judgement and insofar as possible a reevaluation will be made on the grounds of *knowledge* in depth and of a truly affectionate *understanding*.]

It is noteworthy that Sastrahadiprawira wrote this article in Dutch, not in Sundanese or Malay. He was protesting against the Dutch scholars, the true power-holders in the East Indies. On the other hand, by engaging in a debate with Dutch scholars, he was talking himself out of the Sundanese tradition and alienating himself from his countrymen. He argued on the basis of the study of Indology, which had been formed by Dutch scholars, and using the same paradigm as them. It was just as Poerbatjaraka had done with respect to his criticism of Ranggawarsita [Tsuchiya 1990 : 107–108].

Sastrahadiprawira deplored the fact that the negative evaluation of Sundanese literature had not changed since the first publication of the encyclopedia and pointed out that it originated with Grashuis’s anthology of 1874. He pointed out, too, that about 150 Sundanese books had been published by het Bureau voor de Volkslectuur (Balai Poes-taka) by 1921, the date of the revised edition of the encyclopedia. He demonstrated the richness of Sundanese “literatuur” by listing the names of such authors as Moehamad Moesa, Moehamad Soeëb, and Aria Bratadiwidjaja. He criticized the author of the

encyclopedia article for his judgements and insufficient knowledge. Of course, just what was to be included in the category "litteratuur" is not evident. Sastrahadiprawira discussed Sundanese 'literature' only in the context of the Dutch notion of "litteratuur." He could not claim the literariness of Sundanese writing in its own terms.

This notion, then, of Sundanese 'literature' came to be taken over by Sastrahadiprawira's successors, who also failed to think about or write about their own writings in terms that were different from that of the Dutch. They transformed "litteratuur" to "sastra," but without clearly defining the category. This tradition, inherited from the colonial overlord, seems to continue to affect Sundanese thinking.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by a grant from The Daiwa Bank Foundation For Asia and Oceania, of which the late Prof. Kenji Tsuchiya was a member of the board of directors.

Bibliography

- Anonymous. 1780. Proeven van Hoog, Gemeen en Berg Javaans. *Verhandelingen van het Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 2 : 289-298.
- Antlov, Hans. 1995. *Exemplary Centre, Administrative Periphery : Rural Leadership and the New Order in Java*. Richmond : Curzon Press.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail Mikhailovich. 1981. *The Dialogic Imagination*. Austin : University of Texas Press.
- Berge, T. van den. 1993. Van Kennis tot Kunst, Soendanese Poëzie in de Koloniale Tijd. Dissertation, State University of Leiden.
- Boomgaard, P. ; and Gooszen, A. J., ed. 1991. *Changing Economy in Indonesia, A Selection of Statistical Source Material from the Early 19th Century up to 1940. Population Trends 1795-1942*. Vol. 11. Amsterdam : Royal Tropical Institute (KIT).
- Bork, G. J. van ; and Laan, N., ed. 1986. *Twee Eeuwen Literatuur-Geschiedenis*. Groningen : Wolters-Noordhoff bv.
- Commissie voor de Volkslectuur. 1912. *Palanggeran Noelisikeun Basa Soenda koe Aksara Walanda*. Batavia.
- [Commissie voor de Volkslectuur]. [1918]. *Spellingstelsels voor Inlandsche Talen*. [Batavia].
- Crawfurd, J. F. R. S. 1820. *History of the Indian Archipelago*. 4 vols. Edinburgh : Constable ; London : Hurst, Robinson and Co.
- Deenik, A. C. n. y. *Soendaasch proza en poezie*. 2 vols. n. p.
- Djajadiningrat, P. A. Achmad. 1936. *Herinneringen van Pangeran Aria Achmad Djajadiningrat*. Amsterdam ; Batavia : G. Kolff & Co.
- Ekadjati, Edi S., ed. 1988. *Naskah Sunda, Inventarisasi dan Pencatatan*. Bandung : Lembaga Penelitian Universitas Padjadjaran ; Tokyo : The Toyota Foundation.
- Encyclopaedie van Nederlandsch-Indië*. 1896-1905. 4 vols. 's-Gravenhage : Martinus Nijhoff ; Leiden : E. J. Brill.
- _____. 1917-1939. 2 nd edition. 4 vols. and 4 suppliments. 's-Gravenhage : Martinus Nijhoff ; Leiden : N. V. v/h. E. J. Brill.
- Engelmann, W. H. 1867. Nog iets over de Soendaneesche Vertaling van het Evangelie van Lukas. *Java-Bode*. February 2, 1867.
- Ferguson, C. 1959. Diglossia. *Word* 15 : 325-340.
- Gaarder, Jostein. 1995. *Sophie's World*. London : Phoenix.

- Grashuis, G. J. 1870. Over de Spelling van het Sondaneesch met Latijnsch Letterschrift. *Tijdschrift voor Indische Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 19: 490–500.
- _____. 1874. *Soendaneesch Leesboek*. Leiden: A. W. Sijthoff.
- _____. 1881. *Soendanesche Bloemlezing*. Leiden: A. W. Sijthoff.
- _____. 1891. *Bijdrage tot de Kennis van het Soendaneesch*. Leiden: A. W. Sijthoff.
- Haan, F. de. 1910–1912. *Priangan, De Preanger-Regentschappen onder het Nederlandsch bestuur tot 1811*. 4 vols. Batavia: Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen.
- Hoëwell, W. R. van. 1842. Onderzoek naar de Oorzaken van het Onderscheid in Voorkomen, Kleeding, Zeden en Gewoonten, Taal en Karakter tusschen de Soendanezen en de Eigenlijke Javanen. *Tijdschrift voor Nederlandsch-Indië* 4 (2): 132–169.
- Holle, K. F. 1867. Vluchtig Berigt omtrent eenige Lontar-Handschriften, Afkomstig uit de Soendalanden, door Raden Saleh aan het Bataviaasch Genootschap van K. en W. ten geschenke gegeven, met toepassing van de inscriptiën van Kwali. *Tijdschrift voor Indische Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 16: 450–470.
- _____. 1871. Het schrijven van Soendaasch met Latijnsch Letter. *Tijdschrift voor Indische Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 20: 91–107.
- _____. 1890. Dat, en hoe men in 1848 in de Preanger als dienstdaalt nog Javaansch gebruikte. *Tijdschrift voor het Binnenlandsch Bestuur* 9: 128–130.
- Koorders, D. 1863. Boekbeschouwing, A dictionary of the Sunda language of Java, by Jonathan Rigg, Member of the Batavian Society of Arts and Sciences (Verhandelingen van het Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen, deel XXIX). Reprint from *Java-Bode*.
- Kunto, Haryoto. 1984. *Wajah Bandoeng Tempo Doeloe*. Bandung: P. T. Granesia.
- Meinsma, J. J. 1869. Iets uit de Nalatenschap van Mr. D. Koorders. *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde van Nederlandsch Indië* 4 (3): 253–397.
- Mijer, P. 1843. Prijsvragen, uitgeschreven door het Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen. *Verhandelingen van het Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen* 19: v-xcviii.
- Moesa, Moehamad. 1867. *Dongeng-dongeng Pientengen*. Batavia: Landsdrukkerij.
- Molen, W. van der. 1991. Huruf Jawa Cetakan. In *Ilmu-ilmu Humaniora*, pp. 69–84. Jogjakarta: Fakultas Sastra UGM.
- Moriyama, Mikihiro. 1995. Language Policy in the Dutch Colony: On Sundanese in the Dutch East Indies. *Tonan Ajia Kenkyu* [Southeast Asian Studies] 32 (4): 446–454.
- Noorduyn, J. 1962. Over het eerste gedeelte van de Oud-Soendase Carita Parahyangan. *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde van het Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 118: 374–383.
- Ohashi, Atuko. 1994. Jawato Priangan Chiho ni okeru Kohi Yuso to Genchijinshucho Rehento [Coffee Transportation and Regents in Priangan, Java: From the Early 18th Century to the 1820s]. *Tonan Ajia Kenkyu* [Southeast Asian Studies] 32 (1): 66–119.
- Oosting, H. J. 1884. *Soendasche Grammatica*. 's-Gravenhage: Martinus Nijhoff.
- Putten, Jan van der. 1995. Taalvorsers en hun informanten in Indie in de 19e eeuw. Von de Wall als politiek agent in Riau? *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde van het Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 151 (1): 44–75.
- Raffles, T. S. 1817. *The History of Java*. London: Black, Parbury [etc.].
- Rigg, J. 1862. A Dictionary of the Sundanese Language of Java. *Verhandelingen van het Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen* 29: i–xvi, 1–537, i–v. Batavia: Lange & Co.
- Sastrahadiprawira, Memed. 1929. Over de waardeering der Soendaneesche literatuur. *Djawa* 9: 16–21.
- Tsuchiya, Kenji. 1990. Javanology and the Age of Rangawarsita, An Introduction to Nineteenth-Century Javanese Culture, In *Reading Southeast Asia*, pp. 75–108. Ithaca: Cornell University.
- Tuuk, H. Neubronner, van der. 1851. Varia, De Soendasche letterkunde. *Tijdschrift voor Nederland-*

- sch Indië* 13 (1) : 340–342.
- Uhlenbeck, E. M. 1964. *A Critical Survey of Studies of the Language of Java and Madura*. 's-Gravenhage : Martinus Nijhoff.
- Verslag van het Inlandsch Onderwijs in Nederlandsch-Indië over 1863*. 1865. Batavia : Landsdrukkerij.
- Veth, P. J. 1869. Aanteekeningen over de Soendaneesche Taal- en Letterkunde, Fragmenten uit de Correspondentie van W. H. Engelmann met het Hoofdbestuur van het Ned. Bijbelgenootschap. *Tijdschrift voor Nederlandsch Indië* 3 (1) : 255–278.
- Watson, C. W. 1993. The Metamorphosis of a Javanese Aristocrat, The Memoirs of Pangeran Achmad Djajadiningrat. In *Text/Politics in Island Southeast Asia, Essays in Interpretation*, edited by D. M. Roskies, pp. 157–190. Athens ; Ohio : Ohio University Center for International Studies.
- Wilde, A. de. 1829. *Berigten Betreffende de Landschappen, genoemd de Preanger Regentschappen, op Java gelegen*. Amsterdam : M. Westerman.
- _____. 1830. *De Preanger Regentschappen op Java gelegen*. Amsterdam : M. Westerman.
- _____. 1841. *Nederduitsch-Maleisch en Soendasch Woordenboek*, edited by Taco Roorda. Amsterdam : Johannes Muller.
- Zanten, Wim, van. 1989. *Sundanese Music in the Cianjuran Style*. Verhandelingen van het Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde 140. Dordrecht ; Providence : Foris Publications.